

FILE COPY

DGF/BMS/46D

PRIVATE & CONFIDENTIAL

1st November, 1962

FILE NOTE NO. 0330

DISCUSSION WITH G. F. TODD

31st October, 1962

During Todd's visit to R. & D.E., he gave me an account of his recent meeting in Paris with Waltz and Weber. Cuzin and Vaissereau (of the Regie) were also invited but Cuzin was ill and Vaissereau's absence was probably diplomatic. Apparently, the French Regie have been ordered to make no comments in future on Smoking and Health. Any comment will now be made by the French Ministry of Hygiene. Weber believed this was a good move as Vaissereau had recently sent him a document which read very similarly to the R.C.P. report.

The meeting had been called by Waltz to consider counter action to the Neukomm-Bonnet publications in "Z. f. Praventiv-Medezin" in December 1961. The publishers of the journal had agreed to devote a whole issue to a reasoned refutation of the claims and the earliest time this would be possible was about January 1963. Waltz was acting as compiler and the contents would be as follows:

1. Two papers by Cuzin on the chemical investigation of the smoke. The first study will be that reported at Paris, April 1961, and the second will give results obtained subsequently since Cuzin has refined his analytical and smoke collection techniques.
2. A paper on smoke chemistry of extracted cigarettes by Waltz and Hausermann, a copy of which Todd gave me. Waltz stated that he was not entirely satisfied with the Swiss Gauloises cigarettes which Cuzin had investigated and which he, Waltz, had processed. (This does not agree with earlier statements made at Paris in April 1961 that Bonnet had supervised the extraction and manufacture of Cuzin's cigarettes.)
3. A study of the Nicod experiment by a German statistician (Ullmann?) retained by Weber. This is the report shown me by Weber in May 1962 in Hamburg, which criticises the Nicod report in strong terms along the lines of the Todd/D.G.F. paper.

Waltz wishes to include two further papers.

4. A paper based on observation of individual smokers' habits in terms of frequency and size of puffs, depth of inhalation, butt length to which cigarettes are smoked, etc., which leads to the conclusion that the condensate retained in the lungs of a man smoking twenty cigarettes a day may vary by a factor of 30-40 to 1, depending on his smoking habits.

100159022

Weber and Todd could not see this added anything useful to the refutation of the Neukomm-Bonnet process, but equally could not see it could cause trouble in other contexts.

5. The second of Waltz's papers was different, however. Based on a statement by Wynder that a 50% reduction in the tar led to a 'safe cigarette', Waltz had assembled evidence of tar yields for Swiss cigarettes over a number of years and stated that this showed that with the introduction of high-filtration brands, the tar intake of a smoker would be reduced by more than 50%. He had other evidence for filter efficiencies for tar, nicotine and phenols which he wished to include on the basis of a Brand A, Brand B, etc. listing.

Todd and Weber were horrified by this and Todd made the point, that he would be greatly embarrassed if the R.C.P. recommendations would seem to have been adopted in Switzerland. He pointed out to Waltz that other work (by Bock) had shown that reduction in the tar yields did not make for safety but merely reduced the biological activity pro rata. He and Weber very much wanted to avoid any ranking system of brands, with the implicit assumption that this was a ranking in terms of health.

Waltz agreed to think again about this paper and to let Todd and Weber see a redraft.

Todd mentioned that Waltz hoped to see a Swiss version of T.M.S.C. set up. When Todd asked if he could tell me of the various discussions, in view of the B-A.T. interest in Neukomm-Bonnet, Waltz replied that he was consulting Todd in a private capacity and, therefore, would not be agreeable to this.

Todd was also unable to obtain information on the CORESTA standard methods protocol which had been discussed at the October meeting in Budapest, except that Waltz appeared to be revising the documents in his capacity as Secretary of the Groupe Fumee.

10/11

100159023